

**CORE COMPETENCY COMPLIANCE PROGRAM (CCCP)
PART II**

AOA Core Competency Development Task Force

AOA Core Competency MAP

The metrics chosen to assess a resident's achievement of any competency must parallel the teaching process(es) employed by the residency program. As such, each institution will have flexibility when choosing methodologies to assess a resident's performance. Additionally, assessment tools vary in their reliability and validity. Therefore, it is advised than more than one assessment tool be used when assessing residents to improve the overall accuracy. The following tables present eight commonly used assessment metrics. A description of each metric is presented. Common uses, advantages and disadvantages for each are also presented.

360-Degree Evaluation

An assessment tool used to rate the performance of a resident. All individuals that have contact with the resident should complete the evaluation. The information obtained may reveal trends (i.e. patterns of behavior) with certain groups (i.e., nursing staff, adolescent patients, geriatric patients, midlevel practitioners, etc.) that may be useful when providing feedback to the resident.

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
Evaluates: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Communication skills• Interpersonal skills• Professionalism• Teamwork ability	Multiple raters <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Improves validity• Improves reliability Fosters self-reflection <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Self-rating is a component	Peer pressure during process <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Hesitation to be honest Difficult to design <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Standard set of items for all raters• Group-specific subset of items Requires several raters <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Not less than 20 attending physicians• Not less than 20 patients• At least two or more from other groups

Checklist

An assessment tool used to evaluate specific behaviors or tasks that are components of a more complex activity. The checklist records whether the action was performed or not. If performed, the checklist can be designed to identify if the action was performed accurately, partially correct, or unsatisfactorily/wrong.

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
<p>Evaluates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Actions that are objective<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Specific○ Measurable <p>Examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Interviewing• Medical procedures	<p>Useful information for feedback</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• What was not done• What was done<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Correctly○ Acceptably○ Incorrectly	<p>Difficult to design</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• What are the required actions• Requires expert opinion/consensus <p>Evaluator variability</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Raters need to be trained <p>Only useful for fundamental skill assessment</p>

Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE)

An assessment tool that consists of multiple stations. The stations include various elements of clinical encounters. The stations include standardized patients (actors trained to portray illness in a standardized manner), actual patients, and/or components of clinical encounters (i.e., electrocardiograms for interpretation, radiographs for interpretation, etc.).

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
<p>Evaluates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Communication skills• Interpersonal skills• Professionalism• Psychomotor abilities	<p>Multiple assessments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Improves validity• Improves reliability <p>Useful feedback information</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• What the resident does well• What needs improvement	<p>Expensive</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 12 – 18 stations recommended• Selection/Creation of stations• Training of standardized patients (SPs)• Payment of SPs <p>Difficult to design</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Scoring criteria• Passing thresholds

Monthly Service Rotation Evaluation

An assessment tool used to provide a global rating of performance. The forms usually record categories of behaviors, not specific actions, based on rating scales.

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
Evaluates: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Global performance	Familiarity Quick and simple to complete	Highly subjective <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Rater biases<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Leniency○ Halo effect Require direct observation of ratee <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Second hand opinions reduce utility Rater training required

Procedure/Case Logs

An assessment tool used to quantify patient encounters over a period of time.

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
Evaluates: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Document training experience<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Scope○ Volume○ Variety	Can direct training <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Fill exposure gaps• Increase procedural opportunities	Number of cases does not assure competence <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Need to track patient outcomes Assurance of data accuracy <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Quality assurance Time consuming activity <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Data entry

Portfolios

An assessment tool used to document learning experiences. Usually a compilation of written documents (i.e., case logs, procedural logs, research activity, committee involvement, lectures and conferences attended, etc.).

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
Evaluates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li data-bbox="237 678 537 743">• A record of learning accomplishments	Useful for self-reflection on learning Provide a global view of experiences	Time consuming to create Difficult to assign a score

Written Examination

An assessment tool used to assess not only the examinee's knowledge base, but also the ability to apply it to clinical situations. The most common written examination format uses multiple-choice questions.

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
Evaluates: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Knowledge base• Level of understanding	Familiarity Can cover many content areas quickly Can be graded quickly Can monitor progress over time <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Use of anchor (repeated) questions	Require statistical analysis Passing scores should be predetermined Sampling error can occur <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Use test blueprint

Chart Stimulated Oral Recall Examination

An assessment tool used to assess clinical problem-solving ability. Provides the ability to investigate the examinee's rationale for requesting information (i.e., historical or physical examination data), interpretation of information provided, and management of selected cases, not evident by simply reviewing the chart.

Use(s)	Advantage(s)	Disadvantage(s)
Evaluates: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Problem-solving ability<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Ability to use information○ Ability to select the next step	Selected cases can be covered quickly Can ask a series of related questions	Examiners must be trained Scoring can be debated Cases selection can be difficult High anxiety level for some examinees

References

1. Frohna JG et al. Assessing Residents' Competency in Care Management: Report of a Consensus Conference *Teaching and Learning in Medicine* 2004; 16(1):77-84.
2. Swing SR. Assessing the ACGME General Competencies: General Considerations and Assessment Methods. *Academic Emergency Medicine* 2002; 9:1278-1288.
3. ACGME Outcome Project. Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Educations
<http://www.acgme.org/Outcome/>.
4. Noel G et al. How well do Internal Medicine faculty members evaluate the clinical skills of residents? *Annals of Internal Medicine* 1992; 117:757-765.
5. Newble D. Assessing clinical competence at the undergraduate level *Medical Education* 1992;26:504-511.